ARD

Rwanda National Assembly Support Project

USAID

PROJET D'APPUI A L'ASSEMBLEE NATIONALE DU RWANDA
ARD/SUNY
B.P. 7193, Kigali, Rwanda
Tel: (250) 500060
Email: ardsuny@rwanda1.com

ARD/SUNY Rwanda National Assembly Support Project

Final Report

January 2002 - September 2003

Submitted to USAID/Rwanda

by
State University of New York/Center for International Development
SUNY Plaza, Albany, New York 12246
Tel. 518-443-5124; fax 518-443-5126
and
ARD, 159 Bank Street, Suite 300, PO Box 1397, Burlington, VT 05402
Tel. 802-658-3890; fax 802-658-4247

Contract AEP-I-802-00-00003, Task Order No. 802

October 30, 2003

Table of Contents

Attachments

   --   Chronological List of Major Reports and Documents

   --   Project Baselines and Indicators of Success
                    (in both narrative and table format)

ARD/SUNY Rwanda National Assembly Support Project

Final Report[1]: January 2002 - September 2003

Background

Responding to the Rwanda Transitional National Assembly's request for assistance, USAID/Rwanda commissioned the State University of New York (SUNY) to conduct a legislative needs assessment in 1999. Following the recommendations of that report, USAID contracted with ARD/SUNY to provide long-term technical assistance to support the institutional development of the Transitional National Assembly (TNA) under the SUNY Deliberative Bodies IQC.   Initially funded for 13 months (November 2000-December 2001, Phase One), the project was continued, and later extended as Phase Two through September 2003, in response to the Assembly's request for continued assistance.

Accomplishments and activities in the first year included training seminars on legislative drafting, budget analysis, and fiscal decentralization. The project also supported English language instruction for MPs and legislative staff, improved internet connectivity, information technology and library science training for documentation center staff, a library science internship in the US, procurement of research and library materials and photocopy equipment, and an assessment of information technology needs. These results were detailed in the project's End of Year Report dated January 10, 2002.

At the time this report is prepared, a constitutional referendum, the presidential election, and legislative elections have recently been held in Rwanda, important steps for evolving democratic institutions and the country's development following the genocide and war of 1994.

Phase Two Summary

After the departure of first year COP Marcel Pelletier in December 2002, Dr. Douglass Teschner assumed leadership of the project. He began work in February 2002 and arrived full-time in Kigali in April 2002. Ms. Antoinette Habinshuti, who began work in the first year, continued throughout Phase Two as Project Assistant. During Phase Two, the project also benefited from the assistance of three interns: Maximilen Nshimayezu, Gregory Wierzynski, and Pasteur Kalisa.[2]

Project goals in Phase Two were to support the Transitional National Assembly's efforts to (1) to strengthen and modernize the Assembly's management, administrative, and support systems and work methods (with a special emphasis on use of information

---

[1] The ARD/SUNY project 2001-2003 Phase One and Two officially ended September 30, 2003. However, the project continues under a new contracting mechanism managed by ARD, Inc.

[2] Interns provided valuable assistance to the project and expanded the impact of the project to include a role as a training site for future leaders. For example, the first intern, Mr. Maximilien Nshimayezu obtained a full-time government job and sent the project COP a very positive thank you letter for helping launch his career.

technologies); (2) improve the legislative process (including more informed debate, improved budget and policy analysis, and enhanced executive oversight); and (3) enhance the efficiency and capacity of legislators and staff in anticipation of Rwanda's parliamentary elections and transition to democracy.

The focus of activities during the second phase of the project was thus on institutional development, technical assistance, and training. Specific activities are detailed further below. In summary, they included:

- *Information Technology* development including systems consultation by an American expert (April 29-May 10, 2002), internet and email access training for a total of 96 legislators and staff, installation of an ISDN-based internet café in the Assembly library, improvements to the Assembly web site, and electronic archiving and document management training and equipment acquisition;

- *Budget Analysis* training for Deputies and staff (July 22-25, 2002);

- *Policy Analysis and Executive Oversight* seminar (June 19-21, 2002 for Deputies and June 25-27 for staff), including skills to empower Deputies to better exercise control over government actions;

- an internet-based *Bill Drafting* seminar in cooperation with the Boston University School of Law;

- a comprehensive *Assessment of the Legislative Process* with 13 specific recommendations;

- a seminar on *Legislative Ethics*;

- a *Study Tour to the Uganda Parliament* (March 2-8, 2003);

- a June 2003 seminar on *Increasing Citizen Participation* in legislative decision-making;

- training and technical assistance on *Legislative Autonomy;*

- assistance with implementation of a major *Staff Reorganization and Management Modernization* initiative; and

- a consultancy and training on *Bicameralism and Internal Rules Modernization* held in July 2003 in response to the recently passed new Constitution.

A variety of other activities, not specifically required by the formal SOW, were also undertaken by the COP in consultation with the Assembly leadership and the USAID CTO. These included advisory assistance to the Assembly on reviewing the draft Constitution and extensive work on internal rules and procedures for the new bicameral legislature. The COP also served as a resource on the Rwanda parliament and political development for the US Mission and briefed Congressional staffers on the Rwanda political environment.

Administrative autonomy for the legislature (including the power to hire its own staff) is included in the new Constitution, and the project developed specific proposals, currently under consideration by the newly elected Parliament, for an autonomy law, personnel regulations, and revised internal rules. The latter incorporates a variety of modernizations, including public hearings, open access to committee meetings, and increased availability to the public of a variety of legislative documents.

Project results are described below and in detail in the Baseline and Indicators narrative (Annex II) attached.

Project Results

The project has resulted in a number of significant changes in legislative functioning. Some key selected results are as follows:

- the length of 2003 Assembly budget deliberations increased by 50% over 2002, and the Speaker has stated that the quality of the budget debate significantly increased as a result of project training

- 56 MPs received advanced budget skills training

- the new internet café more than doubled the number of computers at the Assembly with internet access

- 96 staff and MPs received training in the use of the internet for research and communication

- 93% of the MPs attended the project's training program on executive oversight and, soon afterward, there was widespread press coverage of the Assembly's inquiry into primary education

- administrative autonomy for the parliament, including the power to hire its own staff, (which was among the COP's 13 major recommendations) is included in the new Constitution

- following the COP's suggestion, the Assembly took an active stance in debating and amending the Constitution

- a number of changes were made to the Constitution to ensure a stronger legislative branch and more effective balance of power (including clarification of bicameral procedures, overlap of Senatorial terms, improved equity in the budget process, reduced power of the executive relative to nomination of Senators, and strengthened Senatorial oversight powers)

- the restructured web site has a variety of new information, thus increasing public outreach and transparency of legislative activities and actions

- citizens and civil society leaders have visited the Assembly, many for the first time, and a formal request procedure for receiving visitors has been developed

- House Speaker Biruta publicly stated the need to implement strategies to increase citizen participation in the Rwanda Parliament

- there was a 28% reduction from 2002 to 2003 in the number of passed bills found unconstitutional

- the legislature has advocated for, and achieved, an increase in necessary resources to ensure its independence and effectiveness, as measured by a 57% increase in the legislative budget from 2001 to 2003

- the Assembly has recognized the need to increase professional staffing in key areas (research, budget oversight, and legal services)

- a Member's bill on legislative autonomy has been drafted for Assembly consideration and debate.

Most importantly, there is a growing understanding among the legislators of the need for an independent and well-informed legislature as a critical component in democracy. The concepts of separation of powers and executive oversight have been key themes, which have been integrated in a broad array of project activities.

Deliverables and Activity Details

This section describes Phase Two activities and deliverables following the format in the Scope of Work agreed in January 2002: "Outline of Proposed Activities for Project Extension." In addition, a listing of major reports and deliverables is attached as Annex I.

I Improvement of the Legislative Process

I. A.   *Improve Legislative Drafting Procedures and Skills*

The technical proposal for Phase Two recalled the first year's training seminar in May 2001 and described future programming in Phase Two, including consolidation of basic techniques, development of more efficient work methods, and introduction of new technologies, including a computerized bill tracking system using the Assembly's LAN. A three-phased training program was proposed for the committee technical directors. These activities were only partially realized for reasons described below.

In order to maximize use of technology, the project installed an ISDN line in the Assembly library which was used by two committee technical directors who participated in an internet-based bill drafting course through Boston University. One important advantage of this approach was the ability to extend the course over several months during the winter and spring of 2002. Bill drafting skills development requires training over an extended period and is thus not as conducive to short-term trainings. Despite this advantage, the disadvantage of this course was that it was in English and only two staffers had the level of language skills necessary to participate.

Given the efficacy of this method, the COP and SUNY home office undertook an effort to identify a comparable internet-based course in French. For example, the COP made conduct with the visiting Secretary General of the Belgium parliament who made several suggestions. These leads did not prove fruitful, however. It has been suggested that internet-based education, in general, is much more developed in Anglophone countries.

Another approach explored was a proposed collaboration with the USAID-funded MSD MINIJUST project to work jointly with the executive branch on bill drafting training. Despite initial interest, MSD withdrew due to insufficient funding.

With respect to the computerized bill-tracking system, the Assembly rejected our offers to assist and has chosen to follow the lead of a UNDP consultant who has provided software used by the Belgian parliament based on the FilemakerPro application. Our consultant, Kim Glenn, argued unsuccessfully that the use of more generic Microsoft products would be a better approach. To date, however, the parliament's understaffed IT specialists have not put a bill-tracking program in place. Despite this project's support for an expanded web site (which will be subsequently described in more detail), bill-tracking information has yet to appear on the LAN. The newly elected Parliament is considering rules changes proposed by the ARD/SUNY project which will mandate that, in the interest of transparency, such information is available on the parliamentary web site.

The limited bill drafting capacity of the parliament staff remains a concern, but the Project concluded that (1) the limited interest of MPs operating within Rwanda's parliamentary system in developing Member bills made this a lesser priority, in the short term, than other areas and (2) the focus, over the long-term, should be on developing a formal bill drafting office within the Parliament. This office, as proposed, would consist of staff with more specialized capacities than the current legislative staffers. With such a professional office in place, not only would the quality of amendment drafting be improved, but it would also encourage more MPs to file member bills. Development of such an office was an important component of the staff reorganization plan discussed later in this report. With the new parliamentary autonomy, the project has also advocated for an expansion of the Parliament's IT staffing. Such staff would provide the necessary support to put in place such important features as the computerized bill-tracking system.

I. B.   Policy Analysis/Evaluation and Executive Oversight Techniques

1. Budget Analysis and Effective Management of the Budget Review Process

Building on a successful Budget Analysis Training Program conducted during the first phase of the project, Advanced Budget Analysis Training was conducted July 22-23, 2002 for the Deputies and July 24-25 for the staff. The program was developed in cooperation with the chair of the Assembly's Budget Committee. 56 MPs and 20 staff attended this training. A report, incorporating recommendations of the two professors, as well as those of the MPs and staff, was completed and filed on July 29, 2002 ("Rapport sur le Séminaire intitule: « Analyze Advance du Processus Budgétaire » tenu du 22 au 25 juillet 2002" by Gerard Rutazibwa and Pierre Rwanyindo Ruzirabwobwa). A 52-page syllabus of the training materials was also produced and distributed to MPs.

The instructors were Professors RWANYINDO Ruzirabwoba Pierre and RUTAZIBWA Gerard, both of the Faculty of Economics and Management at the National University of Rwanda. The project was pleased to identify and use qualified CCN trainers in this effort, believing that using local trainers has the dual benefit of providing training within the local context and also identifying local trainers that the Parliament can access and afford in the future using its own resources.

The impact of this budget training on the quality of the deliberative budget process has been confirmed by Speaker Biruta, including a statement to that affect in a meeting with USAID Mission Director Henderson Patrick. The amount of legislative time spent on the budget process has significantly increased. In 2001, the deliberation period for the year 2002 state budget was 16 days (11/29 –12/14). In 2002, the deliberation period was 24 days (12/3-12/27) representing a 50% increase.

As stated in the project's technical proposal, the development of a formal budget office is a critical component in increasing the parliament's capacity to effectively analyze and understand the budget. Creating such an office was an important component in the project's report on staff reorganization, which will be discussed in more detail later in this report.

2. Policy Analysis for Oversight

A major Policy Analysis and Executive Oversight Training was held June 19-21, 2002 for the Deputies and June 24-26 for the staff. Sixty-four of 69 Deputies (93%) attended at least one day of the three-day seminar for MPs. The training enhanced the Assembly's capacity to fully exercise its legitimate powers and thus will help ensure the "checks and balances" which are so critical to the success of democratic governance.

This program was developed in collaboration with the National Assembly's Political Affairs Committee. The principal trainer was SUNY/CID's Professor Edward R. McMahon, Dean's Professor of Applied Politics and Director of the Center on Democratic Performance at SUNY/Binghamton University. He was assisted by a Rwandan specialist, Professor KANANURA Canisius who is a career diplomat and teaches political science at the Free University of Kigali. Connecticut State Representative Andrew Fleischmann, who happened to be visiting Rwanda as part of an NCSL (the US National Conference of State Legislatures) team, also participated in the discussions.

Two reports were filed: (1) "Training to Enhance the Capacity of the Rwanda National Assembly to Undertake Policy Analysis and Executive Oversight, Final Report" by Edward McMahon, July 16, 2002, and (2) "Resolutions and Recommendations Resulting from the Training to Enhance the Capacity of the Rwandan National Assembly to Undertake Policy Analysis and Executive Oversight," July 17, 2002. The latter was translated into French, and copies were distributed to MPs and staff.

A number of these recommendations were integrated into subsequent activities and reports, including the need for a specialized research unit, reinforcing the technical capacities of staff, legislative autonomy as a critical component of executive oversight, and the need for reorganization of the organizational structure of the parliamentary staff. Enhancing the

capacity of a strong, independent parliament, thus ensuring a separation and balance of power, has been a unifying theme of various project activities.

3. Targets of Opportunity: Ad Hoc Policy Oversight Training

Developing synergies with other USAID and donor projects, as well as responding creatively to requests from the parliament have been a recurring theme. It is important to recognize "windows of opportunity" and take full advantage of them. Some of these types of activities are described below.

The two ARD D/G projects –ARD/SUNY Assembly Support and ARD Fiscal Decentralization -- collaborated in the first year, for example, conducting a seminar on property tax issues in the fall of 2001 in which Deputies from the Budget Committee participated. Another collaboration between these two projects during Phase Two was arranging a tour of the parliament building for local district accountants training in Kigali. This tour paved the way for a more formalized approach to receiving visitors at the parliament.

A document entitled "Opportunities for Collaboration with USAID Projects and Other Donors" dated July 15, 2002, was developed as a result of numerous meetings with Assembly Deputies. This report was submitted to USAID.

An informal collaboration with NCSL (the US National Conference of State Legislatures) was begun in June 2002, relative to their State Department funded project to enhance staff capacities and develop an orientation program for the elected MPs.

A Seminar on Legislative Ethics was presented by the COP on November 14, 2002 to the Kigali Bar Association with MP participation. A document of the same name was prepared for the participants.

A seminar on "Increasing Citizen and Civil Society Participation in the Rwanda Legislative Process" was successfully implemented in June 2003. As noted in the work plan, "Efforts can and should be made to encourage greater contact between the Assembly and the Rwandan citizenry." Fifty-two civil society leaders and 38 MPs attended the June 19-20 conference undertaken in collaboration with the USAID-funded CARE Rwanda Civil Society Strengthening Project. A smaller follow-up conference was held on June 23-24 for the 21 Assembly staff with participation of 7 members of civil society. The trainers were SUNY/CID's consultant Prof. Edward R. McMahon and KANANURA Canisius. A final report with recommendations was completed in July 2003. Recommendations included increasing civil society participation the work of the parliamentary committees, improved media coverage of legislative activities, and creating a more "user friendly" and welcoming Parliament. Many of the NGO representatives said they had never even been in the Parliament building before and some said they did not even know that they could enter.

Another important "window of opportunity" occurred during the Transitional National Assembly's deliberations on the new Rwanda Constitution. The project COP provided a detailed commentary and suggestions on the draft Constitution, focusing on ensuring sufficient legislative powers. Several of the COP's suggestions were integrated in the final version adopted by the TNA in April 2003. These included (1) removal from the

oath of office of a restriction that MPs cannot consider regional issues, (2) ensuring that legislative compromises developed by joint conferences of Deputies and Senators return to both plenaries for approval, (3) legislative autonomy and oversight in relation to the Auditor General, (4) parity with the executive branch with respect to money bills, (5) reduced Presidential power over appointment of Senators, (6) overlap of Senatorial terms to enhance institutional continuity, and (6) clarification of Senatorial oversight powers.

The project also provided a number of requested documents to the Assembly Speaker with respect to public hearings, and introduction of regular public hearings is under consideration as part of the new rules of the parliament.

II. Modernization of Parliamentary Management and Work Methods

II. A.   *LAN Management, Applications Development, and Training*

1. LAN Implementation/Management Support and Training
2. LAN Application/Management System Design

A major activity during this initial part of Phase Two was the second visit of Information Technology systems consultant, American Kim Glenn. Mr. Glenn's consultancy from April 29-May 10, 2002 included an update and reassessment of the analysis of the Assembly he did during a visit to Rwanda last year. Mr. Glenn also developed a template for the Assembly's 5-year IT plan to be integrated in the Government of Rwanda's IT Plan. Mr. Glenn's recommendations are the basis for a number of technology improvements described below. His report entitled "Information Technology Re-Assessment" was completed on May 10, 2002 and subsequently translated into French ("Réévaluation du Projet de Technologie de L'information").

As a result of both Mr. Glenn's report and other factors observed by the COP, it was determined that it was not possible to effectively implement activities 1 and 2 as originally detailed in the technical proposal. The Assembly hired a new LAN manager with recent university training who has managed the Assembly's network while receiving support and training through the UNDP. We have concerns as to both the quality of supervision of this staffer and the long-term efficacy of the applications recommended by the UNDP Belgian consultant. We have also observed turf issues between the IT team and other Assembly staffers, and legislative management has been unable to fully resolve these issues in a way that would ensure efficient and synergistic LAN deployment.

The problem is further compounded by an insufficient number of parliamentary IT staff. Mr. Glenn recommended in the project's first year that the legislative IT staff be increased from two to six. He repeated this assertion in last year's reassessment, but this has not been accomplished to date. Assembly leadership has cited low salaries offered by the executive branch civil service for whom all parliamentary staff members have worked. It is hoped that this will be changed under autonomy. The need to increase the capacity of the IT department has been reinforced in the project's staff reorganization report.

3. Management of the Assembly Website

Training and acquisition of software to support future expansion of the Assembly's web site was conducted. A comprehensive training program for 6 Assembly staff on web site management, including restructuring the Assembly web site, began on November 18, 2002 and continued into early 2003. Computer Bytes was the private vendor selected through a competitive process. The revised web site went on line in May 2003. It includes a new Kinyarwanda section, lists of laws voted, bills under consideration, and links to other Rwanda government sites. The project also acquired web development software for the parliament; Computer Point won the software bid.

Under the proposed new rules, a wide variety of documents, including a bill tracking system, will need to be added to the Parliament's website. We believe that this is an important step in enhancing the transparency and efficiency of Parliament. As noted earlier, however, management will have to play an active role in working through the turf and software compatiblity issues. Staffing will need to be reinforced in both the IT department and the press office which is responsible for the web site. Regular updating of the site will need to be a priority.   Despite these challenges, the project has provided critical training and support which will provide a structural base for this important work.

4. Targeted Computer Training

As described earlier, the original proposal included computer training for bill drafters, development of a LAN-based bill tracking system, and LAN application training. As noted above, these areas were not fully realized. The project did, however, provide some important computer training which has significantly enhanced the parliament's capacity.

An internet café hub and cabling was installed in the Assembly library, and training for 5 Assembly staff to manage the cyber café was held at the time of the opening of the cyber café in November 2002. Media Post was the vendor selected competitively.

Training on use of internet for research and email was conducted for 96 MPs and Assembly staff, using the new cyber café described above. The training, by the competitively selected vendor Media Post, was conducted in two phases (Feb.- March 2003 and May 2003).

This training has provided an important impetus to accelerate computer use at the Parliament. The demand for internet access has driven an increase in the number of computers connected to the internet. At the outset of Phase Two , there were only 5 but this number has risen to 19 (a 280% increase) as of Sept. 30, 2003. UNDP has committed to connecting the Parliament's network to the internet which will significantly expand this number.   72 of 73 staff (99%) now have had email addresses, and 56 reported checking their email every day; 60 of 73 MPs in the TNA had email addresses.

II. B.   Strengthening of Internal Reporting Processes

<u>1. Preparation of daily sitting reports (Compte rendu)</u>
<u>2. Production of verbatim reports (Procès verbaux)</u>

The Assembly has made major accomplishments in getting these reports up to date (including totally eliminating the three-year verbatim report backlog) with assistance from UNDP. Reports are now produced using the Assembly's LAN. While this project proposed an alternative system using more generic software during the project's first year, the Assembly elected to follow the UNDP-recommended FilemakerPro software.

Based on Assembly input, further assistance is not needed, although the project offered to assist in helping to get this information onto the web site. The Assembly leadership did not follow-up on this for reasons discussed earlier.

As will be later discussed, efforts to archive electronically old paper documents are underway, and developing a retrieval system for both the former and newly developed documents has been an important consideration.

As part of the proposed new rules, parliamentary staff have agreed to a very rapid turnover of both the sitting and verbatim reports and their inclusion in a timely manner on the new Parliament's web site.   The specific timeframes have been included in the proposed new rules of the Parliament.

<u>3. Strengthening Research and Information Retrieval/Management Capacity</u>

As described previously, an ISDN line and hub was established in the Assembly library to facilitate internet access for education and research. The "internet café" in the Assembly library is supporting increased internet and email access pending full network connectivity. Training on use of the internet for research was conducted as described above.

The project supported technical assistance, training, and material support with respect to electronic archiving of old documents. This will be discussed further in a subsequent section of this report.

II. C.   Organizational Management and Planning

Support for improved organizational management was reflected in a variety of project activities as described below.

<u>Report on Legislative Processes.</u> A comprehensive report entitled "Analysis of the Legislative Process at the Rwanda National Assembly" by COP Douglass P. Teschner was completed in September 19, 2002 and translated into French. The report (1) describes the critical role of a parliament in democratic governance, (2) provides background information on the Assembly, (3) documents the Assembly's strengths, accomplishments, limitations, and most critical needs, (4) makes 13 strategic recommendations for improving the Assembly, (5) summarizes the activities of the ARD/SUNY Rwanda National Assembly Support Project, and (6) briefly describes the report's implications for donors. The recommendations

included increasing citizen participation in the legislative process and making the Parliament building more "user friendly," increasing resources for budget analysis, enhancing staff professional capacities and internal training capacity, and adoption of legislative autonomy. Both versions were widely distributed to Assembly staff and MPs, as well as to some NGOs and other interested parties.

Study Tour to Uganda Parliament. The original proposal called for a study tour to both Kenya and Uganda. The COP visited the leadership of USAID projects in both Kenya and Uganda and, with advisory assistance from the SUNY/CID home office, determined that a study tour focusing on Uganda would be most useful. (Kenya, for example, is behind Uganda in a number of key areas, including use of technology.) A highly successful study tour to the Uganda Parliament was conducted March 3 –8, 2003. A letter to Speaker Biruta summarized the key aspects of the tour (including the parliamentary commission; professional budget, research, and legal offices; committee roles in executive oversight; open meetings with press access; training; and strategic planning). A number of key initiatives, consistent with the COP's report on the Assembly last September, were developed as a result of this tour and a subsequent (March 18) meeting with Speaker Biruta.   The COP believes that the project's ability to show MPs parliamentary modernization in an African context played a critical role in stimulating interest in subsequent project activities, thus driving planned reforms in the critical areas described next.

Drafting of an Autonomy Law and Personnel Guidelines. Passage of a law detailing the functional aspects of Constitutional autonomy, as well as development of detailed personnel guidelines, was undertaken under the leadership of Hon. Dan Wandera Ogalo, a former Uganda MP and current Member of the East Africa Parliament. Dan made two trips to Rwanda (the first in early June and the second in July, both 2003). Workshops were held on July 9 for MPs and on July 10 for staff. His "Report of the Consultancy on the Legislative Autonomy of the Parliament of Rwanda" included a proposed autonomy bill and personnel regulations. Both of these included revisions based on MP and staff input. Dan Ogalo is a highly effective voice for democracy and the critical role of strong, independent parliaments in Africa. His consultancy had a significant impact, which, it is hoped, will pave the way for critical democratic reforms in the new Parliament.

Staff Reorganization.   In addition to his work on autonomy and personnel regulations, Dan Ogalo helped develop alternative staffing scenarios to enable the new Parliament to more effectively fulfill is legislative responsibilities. A final report, entitled "Modernization and Reorganization of the Rwanda Parliament Management and Professional Staff Capacity (including Proposed Staffing for the New Senate)," was authored by Mr. Ogalo, intern Greg Wierzynski, and COP Teschner. The authors advocate for new staff offices (budget, research, and bill drafting) and include proposed organizational structures for both chambers. A new Department of Shared Services would oversee shared staffing between the new Senate and Chamber of Deputies. Improved administrative functioning is proposed through introduction of a Board of Management. Implementation of this report is under consideration by the new Parliament leadership.

Initial Organizational Issues for Senate. With the new Senate starting "from scratch," the COP developed a July 2003 position paper outlining some of the organizational and functional aspects that need to be considered. Topics included Constitutional powers, committees, space, staffing, and internal rules. The COP also participated, at the Assembly's request, in meetings to develop staffing scenarios for the new Senate.   The new Senate

leadership has been studying this report as part of their process to define the details of how they will function.

Planning for the Post-Transition Bicameralism and Internal Rules Modification. SUNY/CID fielded consultant Prof. Robert Nakamura to conduct this consultancy with trainings for staff on July 18 and MPs on July 21 and 22, 2003. He outlined a variety of issues with respect to having two chambers, including the sharing of staff and how bicameral legislatures in different countries have resolved these issues. New ideas for revising the parliamentary rules, both to improve and modernize them for each chamber, as well as develop joint rules needed under bicameralism, were presented at the MP workshop. The COP subsequently rewrote the proposed rules based on this input. Subsequently, the COP had lengthy work sessions with parliamentary staff to develop a revised version to present to the new MPs. The version which is currently being debated by the MPs incorporates some major reforms, including public hearings, open committee meetings, increased transparency through making documents available on the web site, development if a legislative code of conduct, subpoena powers for oversight, and introduction of legislative caucuses. Ninety percent of the reforms proposed by the project were incorporated in this draft, and we are waiting to see the final versions adopted by the new MPs. Early indications are that they will adopt all, or most, of these important reforms.

III. Logistical and Material Support to the National Assembly

1. Archiving of Assembly Records

The project undertook a multifaceted approach to addressing this issue. First, we implemented an Electronic Archives Consultancy. Consultant Jonas Mutwaza of the National University began his 21-day consultancy on Monday February 10 and completed his work with delivery of a comprehensive final report (including inventory data, recommendations, and training curriculum) dated April 14, 2003.

Secondly, Mr. Mutwaza conducted a two-day training on management of documents and electronic archiving for 19 Assembly staffers on March 24-25, 2003. His final report includes recommendations, the training syllabus, and details of a new document inventory system.

Thirdly, the project provided material assistance. After receiving technical recommendations from ARD consultant Kim Glenn and the electronic archives consultant Jonas Mutwaza, specifications were drawn. After a procurement analysis, the firm Computer Bytes was selected as the vendor of a scanner and two computers with printers. These were delivered to the Assembly in May and a training on their usage was conducted by the vendor for Assembly documentation center staff.

Despite these efforts, the documentation center staff have not implemented the recommendations or used the new equipment for its intended purposes. They have told project staff that they need further training as well as additional staff to do the document scanning. This topic will be further pursued in the new parliament support project.

The original proposal noted that some funds would be used for document binding, but it was determined that the above activities would be more effective in the long term. The

increasing reliance upon electronic, rather than paper, documents is the most cost-effective use of limited project and legislative resources.

2. Supply of Documentary Materials

A significant quantity of books and documents were compiled and given as donations to the Assembly Library, following up on similar donations made in the project's first year. It was decided that further acquisition resources allocated in the work plan would be better spent on enhancing internet research capacity. Binding costs, as originally envisioned, were better spent on the electronic archiving.

3. Maintenance and Repair of Assembly Photocopiers

The Assembly's photocopier service contract was extended into 2003.

The Future

This is an exciting time for Rwanda as this nation faces a period of rapid change and the evolution of democracy. The new Constitution was adopted by the nation on May 26 and it was followed by Presidential and legislative elections in August and September, respectively. While some have questioned the legitimacy of these elections, there can be little doubt that Rwanda has come far since the tragic events of 1994.

The newly elected Parliament, sworn into office October 10, 2003, faces some major changes and challenges -- the shift in the legislative role from appointed to elected, changeover of many Deputies to new people lacking legislative experience, the large increase in the number of women legislators[3], and the many functional changes resulting from the new Constitution (most notably the shift to a bicameral legislature). In this context, USAID's role in enhancing the legislature's institutional capacity, especially given the limited involvement of other donors, has been very significant.

With the end of the Transitional National Assembly so too ends the current project.[4] The new Parliament will benefit from capacity and systems established during the past two years, yet will also require sustained assistance from the donor community. Institutional capacity building is a long-term process, and it is important that the many successes to date be further institutionalized through continued training and technical assistance.

The ARD/SUNY project has laid a critical foundation upon which future assistance can be built. Such needed assistance can be grouped according to a number of key themes:

---

[3] Rwanda now has highest percentage of women legislators in the world, surpassing Sweden which has long held that mark. The Chamber of Deputies consists of 49% women and the Senate is 30% women.

[4] The project will continue, however, under ARD, Inc.'s Analytical Services IQC until September 30, 2004.

   <u>Follow up on Key Institutional Reforms.</u> Working to help finalize passage of the autonomy law, new internal rules, and personnel regulations are important priorities.

   <u>Bringing the New Rules to Life.</u> A number of key reforms are in the rules including public hearings and other areas which will require substantial support with respect to implementation.

   <u>Assisting the New Senate and Bicameralism Training.</u> Lacking any prior experience in bicameralism, the Rwanda MPs will need further assistance in this area.

   <u>Training for New MPs.</u> With the influx of new MPs, including many women, training is needed in legislative procedures and processes, including new member orientation and documents on legislative basics.

   <u>Strengthening Legislative Committees.</u> Committees are the backbone of any legislature, and strengthening their operations is an important area to enhance legislative capacity.

   <u>Increasing Citizen Participation in the Legislative Process.</u> Activities need be built upon the work of the past, including the major seminar with civil society representatives. A database of key stakeholders needs to be developed.

   <u>Improving Communication between the Parliament and Rwandan Citizens.</u> Outreach efforts, further assistance in web development, and enhancement of press capacity to report on parliamentary activities are needed.

   <u>Enhancing Staff Capacity.</u> Human resource development, enhanced internal training capacity, and follow-up on the electronic archiving efforts to date are areas where the new Parliament will need assistance.

   Flexibility and seeking out "windows of opportunity" will be a key to any future such assistance.

Chronological List of Major Phase Two Reports and Documents

"Outline of Proposed Activities for Project Extension" January 10, 2002.

"Information Technology Re-Assessment" by Kim Glenn. May 10, 2002.*

"Quarterly Report No. 02-01" for the period March 1 – May 31, 2002. June 6, 2002.

"Opportunities for Collaboration with USAID Projects and Other Donors" by Douglass Teschner. July 15, 2002.

"Training to Enhance the Capacity of the Rwanda National Assembly to Undertake Policy Analysis and Executive Oversight, Final Report" by Edward McMahon. July 16, 2002.

"Resolutions and Recommendations Resulting from the Training to Enhance the Capacity of the Rwandan National Assembly to Undertake Policy Analysis and Executive Oversight" July 17, 2002.*

"Rapport sur le Séminaire intitule: « Analyse Avancée du Processus Budgétaire » tenu du 22 au 25 juillet 2002" by Gérard Rutazibwa and Pierre Rwanyindo Ruzirabwobwa. July 29, 2002.

"Quarterly Report No. 02-02" for the period June 1- August 31, 2002. September 9, 2002.

"Analysis of the Legislative Process at the Rwanda National Assembly" by Douglass P. Teschner. September 19, 2002* (revised Nov. 5, 2002).

"ARD/SUNY Rwanda National Assembly Support Project: October 1, 2001 – September 30, 2002" report to USAID/Rwanda for Federal Fiscal Year 2002.

"ARD/SUNY Rwanda National Assembly Support Project" Report to the Rwanda National Assembly of Project Activities in anticipation of the Planned Donor Forum. Nov. 6, 2002.*

"Deliverables In Project Year Two -- Status as of November 9, 2002" November 9, 2002.

"Seminar on Legislative Ethics" Presentation by Douglass P. Teschner to the Kigali Bar Association. November 14, 2002.

"IT Inventory" report to USAID/Rwanda. November 16, 2002.

"Observations on the Rwanda Draft Constitution" December 15, 2002; revised Feb. 3, 2003

"Quarterly Report No. 02-03" for the period September 1 – Nov. 30, 2002. Dec. 18, 2002.

Letter to Kimberly Pease (USAID/Rwanda) requesting No Cost Extension from Margaret Clement (SUNY) and Stevens Tucker (ARD). January 22, 2003.

"Project ICT Activities" February 4, 2003

"Project Fact Sheet" revised February 13, 2003

"Presentation Summary for Congressional Staff Visit" February 18, 2003

"Uganda Parliament Study Tour Summary" letter to Speaker Biruta, March 11, 2003.

"Rapport Sommaire sur la Participation a la Formation sur l`Utilisation de l`Internet" by Pasteur Kalisa, March 12, 2003.

"Legislative Powers in the Proposed New Constitution" letter to Speaker Biruta, March 13, 2003.*

"Quarterly Report No. 03-01" for the period Dec.1, 2002 – Feb. 28, 2003. March 24, 2003.

"Rapport sur l'Archivage Électroniques des Documents Conservées au Sein de la Bibliothèque et la Formation sur « La Gestion et Archivage des Documents Administratifs »" by Jonas Mutwaza, April 14, 2003.

"Quarterly Report No. 03-02" for the period March 1 – May 31, 2003. June 10, 2003.

"Some Considerations for the New Rwanda Senate" by Douglass Teschner. July 4, 2003 (revised).*

"Increasing Citizen and Civil Society Participation in the Rwandan Legislative Process, Final Report" by Edward McMahon. July 10, 2003.

"Report of the Consultancy on the Legislative Autonomy of the Parliament of Rwanda, including proposed Autonomy Law and Personnel Regulations"   by Hon. Dan Wandera Ogalo. July 2003.*

"Some Ideas for Improving the Internal Rules and Procedures" by Robert Nakamura and Douglass Teschner, July 2003 original.* Sept. 2003 revised*.

"Rapport Sommaire sur la Participation a la Formation sur l`Utilisation de l`Internet -- Phase 2" by Pasteur Kalisa. Aug. 1, 2003.

"Organizational Planning for the Post-Transitional Legislative Process: Internal Rules Modernization for a Bicameral Parliament" by Robert Nakamura.   August 10, 2003.

"Modernization and Reorganization of the Rwanda Parliament Management and Professional Staff Capacity (including Proposed Staffing for the New Senate)" by Dan Wandera Ogalo, Douglass Teschner, and Gregory Wierzynski. Sept. 6, 2003.

* Asterisked documents were also translated into French.

PROJET D'APPUI A L'ASSEMBLEE NATIONALE DU RWANDA
ARD/SUNY
B.P. 7193, Kigali, Rwanda
Tel: (250) 500060
Email: ardsuny@rwanda1.com

PROJECT BASELINES AND INDICATORS OF SUCCESS

Report of Data in Project Phase Two (ending September 30, 2003)

NARRATIVE

Responding to the National Assembly's request for assistance, USAID/Rwanda commissioned the State University of New York (SUNY) to conduct a legislative assessment in 1999. Following the recommendations of this report, USAID contracted with ARD/SUNY to provide long-term technical assistance to support the institutional development of the Assembly. Initially funded for 13 months (November 2000-December 2001), the project was extended through March 13, 2003 in response to the Assembly's request for continued assistance.[1] The baselines below reflect the status of the Transitional National Assembly (TNA), with respect to three project goals, at the end of the project's first year (December 2001). The indicators selected are designed to document progress during the project's second phase.[2]

GOAL ONE: to strengthen and modernize the Assembly's management, administrative, and support systems and work methods (with a special emphasis on use of information technologies).

Background at end of Project's first year (December 2001): As a result of first year project efforts (as well as support from the UNDP), the National Assembly had 41 networked computers (five of which had internet access), and the verbatim reports of the Assembly's plenary sessions were up-to-date (vs. a three-year backlog at initiation of the project). With USAID support, a web site was launched in June 2001 and maintained by three Assembly staff who received training in March 2002; the site is maintained on a RwandaTel server. A very limited number of staff and Deputies had email access at the National Assembly; only 5 computers had internet access and there was only one computer (in the Library) which was generally available for MPs and staff to access the internet and receive email. There were only 5 email addresses listed on the Assembly's website (three Deputies and two staff). Only two staff members

---

[1] The project was later extended until September 30, 2003.

[2] "Year One" represented a 13-month period from November 2000-December 2001. While the "Year Two" initially reflected the 15-month period from January 2002 until March 2003, this would more accurately referred to as "Phase Two" since it continued, for a period of 21 months, until Sept 30, 2003.

maintained the Assembly's IT system despite past recommendations that this number be increased. (The Assembly has lacked its own civil service personnel system which undermines its independence from the executive branch and has compromised its ability to recruit needed IT staff.)

<u>Goal One Indicators (for second year of the project):</u>

*   Management, administrative, and support systems will be significantly improved through increased use of modern technologies. Indicators for expanded use of technology include:

- The number of computers connected to the internet will, at a minimum, double (from 5 to 10) by March 1, 2003.
  As of May 31, 2003, there were 13 computers connected to the internet, including 7 in the internet café in the Assembly library which opened on November 15, 2002. The target goal of 10 was surpassed. Further, the number increased to 19 (a 280% increase from the initial number) as of Sept. 30, 2003.

- The number of Assembly IT staff will increase by 100% (from 2 to 4) by March 1, 2003.
  As of September 30, 2003, this number remains unchanged, despite the strong recommendation of consultant Kim Glenn who visited Rwanda in April and May 2002 and continuous reminders by the COP. The positive news is that the proposed Constitution will give the Assembly administrative and fiscal autonomy, thus creating a mechanism to increase IT salaries and directly recruit needed staff. A consultant came Kigali in June and July 2003 to draft an autonomy law and develop personnel guidelines for the post-election Parliament. The project also recommended a staff reorganization plan. All of these will be considered by the newly elected Parliament.

- A minimum of 120 Assembly staff and Deputies will have email addresses by March 1, 2003, and at least 75 email addresses will be listed on the National Assembly's website.
  As of August 2003 (prior to dissolution of the Transitional Assembly), 72 of 73 staff (99%) had email addresses and 56 reported checking their email every day. 60 of 73 MPs had email addresses. The target of 120 was thus surpassed by 12. However, there are still only 5 "official" email addresses listed on the Assembly's website (three Deputies and two staff), and new email addresses were not added in the initial phase of restructuring the web site (which went on line in May 2003). In February, March and May 2003, training on the use of the internet was conducted (96 MPs and staff attended).

*   A new bill tracking system will be in place by March 1, 2003 which will (1) facilitate information retrieval for both staff and Deputies, (2) increase public access to the activities of the Assembly, and (3) create a base for future electronic archiving.
  As of September 30, 2003, this has not been realized. The Assembly had begun to adopt a Belgian consultant's FilemakerPro-based bill tracking application with funding by the UNDP, but this information has not, as yet, been added to the Parliament's web site. Our project contracted with Computer Bytes to conduct web site training/restructuring in the fall of 2002 and winter of 2003 (now completed with a revised site on line as of May 2003). The Parliament staff has drafted internal rules which, if adopted by the newly elected MPs, will require that this information be added to the web site.

GOAL TWO: to improve the legislative process (including more informed debate, improved budget and policy analysis, and enhanced executive oversight).

Background at end of the Project's first year: During the project's first year, seminars were conducted on budget analysis, legislative library management, and fiscal decentralization. Still, the National Assembly was limited in its capacity to realize its full potential as a result of (1) a limited institutional history, (2) the relative inexperience of both the staff and MPs, and (3) limited training on key elements of the legislative process. The Constitutional Court deemed a significant number of bills passed by the Assembly unconstitutional (7 of 55 equaling 13% in 2001). Also, information about the Assembly's activities was not widely available, but a new web site had been created (with USAID support). Democracy requires that there be effective "checks and balances", and, while the Assembly had taken steps to assert its independence, it had yet to fully realize its capacity to counterbalance executive branch power. In the years 2000 and 2001, the Assembly did not reject a single bill submitted by the Executive Branch (although nearly all were amended to some extent). In 2001, only 4% (2 of the 55) of the bills passed were initiated by the Deputies, while 96% (53 bills) that passed had been originally proposed by the executive branch Ministries.

Goal Two Indicators (for second year of the project):

*   A minimum of 40 Deputies will be trained in advanced budget analysis skills, thus enhancing their ability to effectively understand and amend the budget and question Ministry officials.
> *21 Deputies attended the first budget training in October 2001. Advanced training was held on July 22-23, 2002, and 56 Deputies (out of 69 total) attended at least one day. (In addition, 20 staff attended budget training on July 24-25, 2002.) The target goal was surpassed.*

*   A minimum of 20 Deputies will be trained in techniques of policy analysis, executive oversight, and ensuring constitutionality of bills passed.
> *64 of 69 Deputies (93%) attended at least one day of a three-day seminar on Public Policy Analysis and Executive Oversight held at the National Assembly from June 19-21, 2002. The target goal was surpassed.*

*   The number of bills passed by the Assembly which are found unconstitutional by the Constitutional Court will be reduced by a minimum of 20% from year 2001 to year 2002.
> *In the year 2000, 2 of 54 bills passed (4%) were found unconstitutional by the Constitutional Court. This number increased to 7 of 55 (13%) in 2001.   In 2002, 5 of 44 bills passed (11%) were found unconstitutional. The target 20% reduction was thus achieved (from 7 to 5 = 28% reduction).   For the eight final months of the Transitional National Assembly (Jan.-Aug. 2003), there was a further improvement as only 2 out of 39 passed bills (5%) were found unconstitutional.*

* The amount of public information on Assembly activities will significantly increase, as measured by a doubling of the number of printable pages on the Assembly's web site by March 1, 2003.

> *The number of pages on June 24, 2002 was 199. As a result of project-funded training and technical assistance, the site was restructured with the addition of a Kinyarwanda section, listings of voted laws and bills under consideration, the new Constitution, and links. The total number of pages is 344, a 73% increase but less than the 100% projected. Significant further additions are anticipated under the newly elected Parliament, consistent with proposed new internal rules,*

* The independence of the Parliament and its capacity to effectively analyze and consider legislation will be increased as measured by:

- The number of bills submitted by Ministry officials that are rejected ("killed") will increase from zero in years 2000 and 2001 to two in year 2002.

  > *The number of Ministry bills rejected by the Assembly in 2000 and 2001 was 0 in both years (compared to 54 passed in 2000 and 55 passed in 2001). In 2002, one was rejected (compared to 44 passed), while for the final eight months of the TNA in 2003, none were rejected, compared to of 39 passed.*

- The number of passed bills introduced by Deputies independent of the Ministries will double from two passed in 2001 to four passed in 2002.

  > *The number of Members bills passed was 2 of 19 (9.5% of bills passed) in 1998; one of 54 (2%) in 2000; two of 55 (4%) in 2001; none out of 44 passed (0%) in 2002; and none out of 39 passed for the final eight months of the TNA in 2003. While passage of a large number of member bills was not achieved in the TNA, there is a recognized need within the Parliament for more such bills as specifically noted in the final TNA report. This understanding is clearly a result of the seminars conducted by the project.*

- The duration of the deliberative budget process will increase by 25% from the 2001 to 2002, as measured by the time period from initial committee deliberation of the state budget until final plenary passage.

  > *In 2001, the deliberation period for the year 2002 state budget was 16 days (11/29 –12/14). In 2002, the deliberation period was 24 days (12/3-12/27) representing a 50% increase. The target was achieved.*

GOAL THREE: **to enhance the efficiency and capacity of legislators and staff in anticipation of Rwanda's forthcoming parliamentary elections and transition to full democracy.**

Background at the end of the Project's first year: In the first year of the project, a seminar was held on bill drafting. Two Assembly staffers began participating in an internet-based bill-drafting program offered by the Boston University School of Law. Most of the staff members were limited in their duties to primarily administrative roles. For example, there were no staff members who had specialized duties in research or budget analysis, and the MPs had limited access to significant independent information aside from what was presented by the Ministries. The Assembly recognized the need for more specialized staff assistance and changed the titles of the staff assigned to each of the ten Assembly standing committees from committee secretaries to technical directors. Archiving of Assembly records was limited to nonelectronic means without a good system to revisit what the Assembly had accomplished; this compromised the Assembly's "institutional memory" and impeded its effectiveness. With the planned national elections and potential changeover of MPs, it was imperative that the Assembly enhance its institutional capacity.

Goal Three Indicators (for second year of the project):

*   A minimum of 10 Assembly staff will receive training in policy analysis and methods to enhance the capacity of Deputies to receive independent information and better understand policy issues and thus improve the quality of debate and lawmaking.
> *22 staff (out of 25 invited) participated in a seminar on the Key Role of Staff in Policy Analysis and Executive Oversight from June 25-27, 2002. The target was surpassed.*

*   The professional capacity of staff to undertake policy and budget analyses and research will be enhanced by March 1, 2003, as indicated by (1) an increase in the number of committee technical directors and other staff directly involved in research and budget analyses; (2) an increase in the number of committee secretaries/reporters (the higher the number, the more time the committee technical directors will have to devote to analysis and research), and (3) the ratio of technical directors to secretaries/reporters (5:1 in December 2001) will be reduced by 50% by March 1, 2003.
> *As of September 30, 2003, there were 10 technical directors and 2 committee reporters for a ratio of 5:1. The need to augment staff was much discussed at project trainings for Deputies and staff and incorporated in the recommendations of both. A major staff reorganization is now planned as a result of the new Constitution granting autonomy, and also as a result of the Uganda study tour in March 2003.*

*   The number of issues devoted to Executive Oversight/Questioning of Ministers in plenary session will double from calendar year 2001 to calendar year 2002.
> *The history of such sessions by calendar year is as follows: 3 in 1999; 5 in 2000; 11 in 2001; 8 in 2002; and 6 in 2003 (8 months). The target was not achieved, although there was some evidence that the quality of these oversight sessions has increased consistent with growing media coverage (for example, the lead headline of the July 31, 2002 Rwanda Voice was "Parliament Summons Education Minister").*

* A system of electronic archiving will be operational by March 1, 2003.

    The project hired a consultant to develop a plan which was completed on April 14, 2003.

* The capacity of the 10 committee technical directors to draft bills and amendments will be enhanced through new training.

    Two Assembly staff members participated in an internet training in English offered through Boston University.

* The 2003 National Assembly operating budget will increase by 15% over the 2002 budget.

    Rwanda follows a calendar year budget cycle with budget approval normally in December prior to the budget year. The National Assembly operating budget:

    in 2000 was 862,835,833 FRw (0.795% of the 108,539,915,624 FRw total Government of Rwanda operating budget);

    in 2001 was 906,220,614 FRw (0.798 % of the total GOR operating budget of 113,475,827,732 FRw); and

    in 2002, was 1,307,030,182 FRw (0.806 % of the total GOR operating budget of 162,166,047,360 FRw), a 44% increase over 2001.

    in 2003, is 2,083,235,181 FRw (1.11% of the total GOR operating budget of 186,887,774,671 FRw), a 59% increase over 2002. However, this large increase is misleading given that the budget of the Legal and Constitutional Commission was moved from the Office of the President budget to the Assembly's for 2003. A more comparative figure (subtracting out the Legal and Constitutional Comm. budget) is 1,424,911,217 FRw (0.762% of the total GOR operating budget), a 9% increase.

While the 15% target was not realized, the increase was significant and followed a 44% increase the year before. Given the important Constitutional work, the Assembly delayed further budgetary advancement to support that effort. At the same time, plans are underway to implement administrative autonomy under the new Constitution and undertake major staff reorganization in 2003.

SUMMARY OF QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS   September 30, 2003

Indicator	Unit of Measure	Baseline Value		Target Data		Actual Data		Frequency	Method of Acquisition
		Date	Value	Date	Value	Date	Value		
Computers connected to Internet	Number	12/01	5	3/03	10	5/03 9/03	13 19	Quarterly	Inquiry to IT staff
Number of IT staff	Number	12/01	2	3/03	4	9/03	2	Quarterly	Inquiry to IT staff
MPs & staff with email addresses on NA website	Number	12/01	5	3/03	75	9/03	5	Quarterly	Review of web site
MPs and staff with email addresses	# / total # (%)	12/01	NA	3/03	120/145 (83%)	8/03	132/146 (90%)	Semi-annually	Info requests to the Sec.-Dep. & Sec. General
Deputies trained in budget analysis skills	Number	2001	21	2002	40	5/03	56	Annually	Attendance records
Deputies trained in executive oversight skills	Number	2001	--	3/03	20	5/03	64	Annually	Attendance records
Bills passed found unconstitutional	# uncon./ # passed (%)	2000 2001	2/54 (4%) 7/55 (13%)	2002	(10%)	2002 2003 (8mo.)	5/44 (11%) 2/39 (5%)	Semi-annually	Info. request to NA Counselor to President
NA web site pages	Number	6/02	199.	3/03	398	9/03	344	Semi-annually	Count on web by project staff
Ministry bills "killed" by the NA	# killed/ # passed (%)	2001	0/55 (0%)	2002	2	2002 2003 (8mo.)	1/44 0/39	Semi-annually	Info. request to NA Counselor to President
Passed bills introduced by MPs	# / total passed (%)	2000 2001	1/54 (2%) 2/55 (4%)	2002	4	2002 2003 (8mo.)	0/44 0/39	Semi-annually	Info request to NA Counselor to NA President

Indicator	Unit of Measure	Baseline Value		Target Data		Actual Data		Frequency	Method of Acquisition
		Date	Value	Date	Value	Date	Value		
Budget deliberation process duration	# days from 1st comm.. meeting until final passage	2001 (for 2002 budget)	16	2002 (for 2003 budget)	20	2002 (for 2003 budget)	24	Annually	Data provided by Budget Committee technical director (incl. written committee agenda)
Staff trained in policy analysis	Number	2001	--	3/03	10	5/03	22	Annually	Attendance records
The ratio of technical directors to reporters	# of TDs/ # of Rs	12/01	10/2 = 5	3/03	2.5	9/03	10/2 = 5	Quarterly	Info request to NA staff
Issues devoted to executive oversight in plenary sessions	Number/ calendar year	1999 2000 2001	3 5 11	2002	22	2002 2003 (8mo.)	8 6	Semi-annually	Info request to NA Counselor to NA President
Operating budget of the National Assembly	FRw per calendar year	2000 2001 2002	863m 906m 1,307m	2003	1,503 (15% increase)	2003	2,083 (59% incr.with LCC incl.) 1,424 (9% incr. w/o LCC)	Annually at end of calendar year	Official Gazette of the Republic of Rwanda

Indicators table // Most recent update: Oct.. 23, 2003